

COURT-I

**IN THE APPELLATE TRIBUNAL FOR ELECTRICITY
(Appellate Jurisdiction)**

**APPEAL NO. 337 OF 2016 & IA NO. 730 OF 2016 & IA NOS. 58, 711 & 951 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 342 OF 2016 & IA NOS. 750 & 751 OF 2016 & IA NO. 199 OF 2018 &
IA No. 1176 OF 2019**

APPEAL NO. 28 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 28 & 30 OF 2017

APPEAL NO. 29 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 42 & 44 OF 2017

APPEAL NO. 30 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 755 & 756 OF 2016 & 1312 OF 2019

APPEAL NO. 33 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 62, 64 & 589 OF 2017

APPEAL NO. 57 OF 2017 & IA NO. 102 OF 2017

APPEAL NO. 77 OF 2017 &

IA NOS. 207, 209 & 972 OF 2017, IA No.1259 OF 2018 & IA No. 357 of 2019

APPEAL NO. 221 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 456, 505 & 457 OF 2017

APPEAL NO. 353 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 881, 882 & 883 OF 2017

APPEAL NO. 370 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 980, 979 & 982 OF 2017

APPEAL NO. 394 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 1091, 1092 & 1093 OF 2017

APPEAL NO. 236 OF 2018 & IA NOS. 964, 963, 965 & 966 OF 2018

APPEAL NO. 237 OF 2018 & IA NOS. 1074, 1073, 1075 & 1076 OF 2018

AND

APPEAL NO. 299 OF 2018 & IA NOS. 1289, 1288 & 1290 OF 2018

Dated: 19th August, 2019

**Present: Hon'ble Mrs. Justice Manjula Chellur, Chairperson
Hon'ble Mr. S.D. Dubey, Technical Member**

In the matters of:

APPEAL NO. 337 OF 2016 & IA NO. 730 OF 2016 & IA NOS. 58, 711 & 951 OF 2017

Bharti Airtel Ltd. Appellant(s)

Versus

Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. Respondent(s)

**Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Anand K. Ganesan
Ms. Swapna Seshadri
Mr. Ashwin Ramanathan**

**Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1**

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

**APPEAL NO. 342 OF 2016 &
IA NOS. 750 & 751 OF 2016, IA NO. 199 OF 2018 & IA No. 1176 of 2019**

Tata Teleservices (Maharashtra) Ltd. **Appellant(s)**
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Ors. **Respondent(s)**

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Ajay Kumar
Mr. Shailesh K. Kapoor
Ms. Suruchi Thapar

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

Mr. Gaurav Mitra
Mr. Vishnu Sharma
Mr. K.R. Sasi Prabhu for RJIL

APPEAL NO. 28 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 28 & 30 OF 2017

Idea Cellular Ltd. **Appellant(s)**
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Ors. **Respondent(s)**

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Raghav Pandey

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 29 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 42 & 44 OF 2017

Vodafone India Ltd. **Appellant(s)**
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. **Respondent(s)**

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Raghav Pandey

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 30 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 755 & 756 OF 2016 & 1312 OF 2019

Telenor (India) Communications Pvt. Ltd. & Anr. **Appellant(s)**
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. **Respondent(s)**

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Shailesh K. Kapoor
Ms. Suruchi Thapar
Mr. Ajay Kumar

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 33 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 62, 64 & 589 OF 2017

Vodafone Mobile Services Ltd. **Appellant(s)**

Versus

Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. **Respondent(s)**

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Raghav Pandey

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 57 OF 2017 & IA NO. 102 OF 2017

Reliance Communication Ltd. & Anr. **Appellant(s)**

Versus

Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. **Respondent(s)**

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Shailesh K. Kapoor
Ms. Suruchi Thapar
Mr. Ajay Kumar

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

**APPEAL NO. 77 OF 2017 &
IA NOS. 207, 209 & 972 OF 2017, 1259 OF 2018 & 357 of 2019**

ATC Telecom Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd. & Ors. (ATC TIPL) **Appellant(s)**

Versus

Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. **Respondent(s)**

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Shailesh K. Kapoor
Ms. Suruchi Thapar
Mr. Ajay Kumar

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 221 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 456, 505 & 457 OF 2017

Aircel Limited **Appellant(s)**
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. **Respondent(s)**
Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Raghav Pandey
Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1
Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 353 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 881, 882 & 883 OF 2017

GTL Infrastructure Ltd. & Anr. **Appellant(s)**
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. **Respondent(s)**
Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Sandeep Deshmukh
Mr. Vasim Siddiqui
Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1
Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 370 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 980, 979 & 982 OF 2017

Tower Vision India Pvt. Ltd. **Appellant(s)**
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. **Respondent(s)**
Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Shailesh K. Kapoor
Ms. Suruchi Thapar
Mr. Ajay Kumar
Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1
Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 394 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 1091, 1092 & 1093 OF 2017

Indus Towers Limited **Appellant(s)**
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. **Respondent(s)**
Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. Raghav Pandey

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 236 OF 2018 & IA NOS. 964, 963, 965 & 966 OF 2018

M/s ASCEND Telecom Infrastructure Pvt. Ltd. Appellant(s)
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. Respondent(s)

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Ms. Neha Bhatia

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 237 OF 2018 & IA NOS. 1074, 1073, 1075 & 1076 OF 2018

M/s Unity Telecom Infrastructure Ltd. Appellant(s)
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. Respondent(s)

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Mr. S. K. Nanda

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

APPEAL NO. 299 OF 2018 & IA NOS. 1289, 1288 & 1290 OF 2018

Airkonnect Networks Pvt. Ltd. Appellant(s)
Versus
Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission & Anr. Respondent(s)

Counsel for the Appellant(s) : Ms. Kiran Singh
Mr. Amit Nagar

Counsel for the Respondent(s) : Mr. Buddy A. Ranganadhan
Ms. Stuti Krishn for R-1

Ms. Shruti Awasthi for R-2

ORDER

IA NO. 1176 of 2019 in Appeal No.342 of 2016
(Appln. for impleadment intervention)

IA No. 1176 of 2019 is allowed.

Amendment shall be filed within one week i.e. by 26.08.2019.

Appellant shall also file memo adopting the pleadings and written arguments already placed on record by the present Appellant.

IA NO. 1312 of 2019 in Appeal No.30 of 2017
(Appln. for amendment of the memo of parties)

IA No. 1312 of 2019 is allowed.

Appellant is permitted to delete the party, as stated in the application and shall also file amended cause title.

Appellant shall also amend the cause title accordingly by impleading proper and necessary party within one week i.e. by 27.08.2019.

APPEAL NO. 337 OF 2016 & IA NO. 730 OF 2016 & IA NOS. 58, 711 & 951 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 342 OF 2016 & IA NOS. 750 & 751 OF 2016 & IA NO. 199 OF 2018
APPEAL NO. 33 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 62, 64 & 589 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 28 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 28 & 30 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 29 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 42 & 44 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 30 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 755 & 756 OF 2016
APPEAL NO. 57 OF 2017 & IA NO. 102 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 77 OF 2017 &
IA NOS. 207, 209 & 972 OF 2017, IA No.1259 OF 2018 & IA No. 357 of 2019
APPEAL NO. 221 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 456, 505 & 457 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 353 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 881, 882 & 883 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 394 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 1091, 1092 & 1093 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 370 OF 2017 & IA NOS. 980, 979 & 982 OF 2017
APPEAL NO. 236 OF 2018 & IA NOS. 964, 963, 965 & 966 OF 2018
APPEAL NO. 237 OF 2018 & IA NOS. 1074, 1073, 1075 & 1076 OF 2018 AND
APPEAL NO. 299 OF 2018 & IA NOS. 1289, 1288 & 1290 OF 2018

Since written arguments are filed in all these matters, **judgement is reserved.**

(S. D. Dubey)
Technical Member
pr/vt

(Justice Manjula Chellur)
Chairperson